

CITY OF SUMMIT HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

MEETING DATE: FEBRUARY 19, 2025 TIME: 7:00 PM

LOCATION: CITY HALL, LARGE CONFERENCE ROOM (SECOND FLOOR)

CALL TO ORDER

ADEQUATE NOTICE STATEMENT

PRESENT: CAROLINE KING, JAMES BURGMAYER, MIKE DIGERONIMO, SUSAN BRADY, MARY MALLOY, BONNIE MORRISON, NICK CURIALE, JENNIFER ALVAREZ (via phone)

ABSENT: MEREDITH GAYLORD, JESSICA ROY, BOB PAWLOWSKI

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: MEETING OF JANUARY 15, 2025

B Morrison moved to ratify submission; N Curiale seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

ADVISORY REVIEWS: Items for Discussion

1. 30 Wallace Road: Canoe Brook Country Club. Revisions to staff housing portion of application. All of the revisions to the architectural plans are in the interior of the building. The HPC has no comments. S Brady moved to ratify submission; M DiGeronimo seconded. The motion carried unanimously.
2. 49 Tulip Street: Rear yard setback for rear bump out and patio. Building coverage, lot coverage, FAR. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-3.pdf> p187-188 c1955. The most prominent change to the street elevation is the extended second story dormer. The elongation of the dormer does not change the visual integrity of the original building. All of the facade materials on the additions match the facades on the original structure with the exception of the porch. The HPC would like the applicant to clarify what exterior material is enclosing the open porch area. M Malloy moved to ratify submission; N Curiale seconded. The motion carried unanimously.
3. 67 Dale Drive: Lot coverage and rear yard setback for exceeding prior approval for patio. c1967. The existing patio is in the rear of the property and is not visible from the street. The HPC has no comment. B Morrison moved to ratify submission; M Malloy seconded. The motion carried unanimously.
4. 6 Llewellyn Road: Install swimming pool in the front yard, renovate and expand the residence driveway and patio area, and other improvements to the property. C variances for minimum front yard average for Beechwood Rd and Llewellyn Rd, minimum total side yard, max lot coverage, max building coverage and accessory structure location. <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Kent-Place-to-Llewellyn-Road-Vol-5.pdf> p489-490 c1930 contributes to district (North Side).

6 Llewellyn Road, a circa 1930 Colonial Revival, is contributing to the North Side Historic District as noted in the Summit Survey of Historic Resources. Distinguishing features include a palladian window and a semi-circular entry rotunda. The property can be referenced at <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Kent-Place-to-Llewellyn-Road-Vol-5.pdf> p489-490

The proposed plan is substantively a demolition of the home with the exception of the garage and short sections of wall on the east side of the original structure. The proposed plans do not conform to the character of the historic district and neighborhood, nor the Development Design Guidelines (DDG) section of the City of Summit Development Regulations Ordinance (DRO). The DDG section on Historic Districts and Buildings states "All work performed within historic districts or on historic structures shall be visually compatible with the existing buildings in the neighborhood."

The façade design creates large sections of blank wall facing the street and does not have

the depth and relief of the existing home and others in the neighborhood making it inconsistent with the DDG sections on Rhythm of Solids to Voids and Relief. As stated in the Development Design Guidelines, "Existing buildings often have more relief and texture than their modern counterparts. This can be attributed to the depth of window or door openings; the visual qualities of shadows created by use of porches; setback; and the profiles and depth of cornices, moldings, columns and trim. Additions and new buildings shall reflect this quality."

The windows in the proposed plan are also not visually compatible with existing 1930 colonial revival. Per the DDG, "Windows and doors shall be visually compatible with those in the original building and neighborhood." Considerations for window design in these districts should include: materials, proportions (height-to-width ratios), types of windows and configurations, and special design features

The HPC objects to the application in its current form and would recommend that the applicant seek a design solution that is more contextual; sensitive to the neighborhood and surroundings; and more consistent with the Development Design Guidelines in the DRO and the City's Master Plan

M Malloy moved to ratify submission; J Burgmeyer seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

5. 28 Londonderry Way: C variances for building coverage, side yard setback, and rear yard setback for a one story addition at rear of house. Remove and replace deck. Portion of driveway removed. c1954.

The proposed addition is in the rear of the property and barely visible from the street. The proposed exterior siding and roofing materials were not noted on the elevations. The HPC recommends that the exterior siding be wood shingles and the roof be slate to match the existing exterior. S Brady moved to ratify submission; J Burgmeyer seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

6. 695 Springfield Avenue: Red Cross. Additional documents - traffic study.

The HPC has no comment on the new traffic study.

Prior comments from HPC review dated 11/18/24....

As noted in a prior review, the scale and massing of the proposed sanctuary structure and the significant loss of tree cover across the whole property will create a stark change along Springfield Avenue and the surrounding properties.

The front-facing façade consists of two sections of large blank walls (approximately 40'long x 30' tall and 60'x30' tall) of EIFS stucco and wood planking, a portion of which projects in the required front yard setback as close as 42.7' to the Springfield Avenue right-of-way.

The proposed streetscape is inconsistent with the Development Design Guidelines (DDG) in the City's Developments Regulations Ordinance (DRO).

The applicant's efforts to include green and sustainable elements in this application are commendable and the HPC would like to point out that Adaptive Reuse is one of the greenest techniques that can be employed. Reuse is a great way to be sustainable while respecting the history of the community. We would suggest the applicant consider incorporating the existing principal structure into the design of the complex and could be a location for the meeting rooms, offices and other secondary functions that occupy the proposed sprawling footprint.

The original house was built in 1901 as private residence and was later adaptively reused as American Red Cross offices for many decades. As noted in the Historic Sites Survey (<https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/09/Springfield-Ave-to-Waldron-Ave-Vol-8-part-2.pdf>) "The house was built as the home of David Leslie Young, who moved to Summit from Brooklyn in 1900. The Young family had a lumber and millwork business in New York City, and artisans from the shop are said to have supervised construction of the house's interior. The Young family occupied the house until 1945. In 1959, it was purchased by the Red Cross, and has been used as their offices since that time. The house was a notable architectural achievement, harmoniously combining elements of Tudor half timbering, Mediterranean stucco and arcades, and prairie style emphasis of roof and

chimney.”

Of particular note are the deep porches and terraces on the exterior and the unique entry rotunda and elaborate millwork inside portions of the home.

The HPC objects to the application in its current form and would recommend that the applicant seek a design solution that is more contextual; sensitive to the neighborhood and surroundings; and more consistent with the Development Design Guidelines in the DRO and the City’s Master Plan.

B Morrison moved to ratify submission; M DiGeronimo seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

#### NEW BUSINESS

1. Preservation NJ HPC Roundtable
2. 45 Prospect Hill Avenue: <https://www.summitlibrary.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/05/Park-Avenue-cont-to-South-Street-Vol-7.pdf> p287-288 c1925 Tudor Revival contributes to district (North Side)

#### OLD BUSINESS

1. Demolition ordinance

#### LIASON UPDATES:

1. Planning Board: Saturday, February 22, 2025 Planning Board training session

MEETING ADJOURNED: 8:20 PM

NEXT MEETING DATE: March 19, 2025