

CITY OF SUMMIT HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING
MINUTES

MEETING DATE: March 16, 2016

TIME: 7:30 pm

LOCATION: City Hall, Large Conference Room (2nd floor)

MEETING DATE: March 16, 2016

TIME: 7:30PM

LOCATION: City Hall, Large Conference Room (2nd floor)

Meeting called to order at 7:33 pm

IN ATTENDANCE: James Burgmeyer, Tom Conway, Meredith Gaylord, Patricia Meola, Claire Toth, Dolores Ward, David Naidu (Council Liaison)

ABSENT: Dorothy Burger, Eric Warren

Reading of Adequate Notice Statement

Approval of minutes from meeting of February 17, 2016 (circulated by Patricia Meola)

Approval moved by Meredith Gaylord; seconded by Dolores Ward

ADVISORY REVIEWS—Items for Discussion

1. 6 Essex Road- ZB application for (c) variance for rear yard setback to construct two-story addition. House was constructed c. 1920. Prepared by Tom Conway:

The home located at 6 Essex Road was constructed in c.1920 as is an excellent example of the “Colonial Revival Cottage” style. Its distinctive 7 bay symmetrical original form has survived primarily intact with a number of additions within the last 20 years. The last round of renovations with the two story colonnade on the North side of the house are distinctly not in keeping with the original simple cottage style of the house. The home maintains the uniform shingle siding painted white with dark shutters, and the siting set back far from the street - typical in the portion of Essex Road. This pattern of development on this street creates often a tight back yard, as illustrated in this home.

The proposed additions are to the rear of the home and are not easily visible from the street, which is good. The rear addition off the family room is simple and straight forward, and the renovations to the kitchen and dinette are as well. The Historic Preservation Commission really just has issue with the proposed over- scaled two story covered porch and balcony “turret” addition that really has nothing to do with the rest of the home, other than perpetuating the odd two story porch addition to the north (referenced above). This piece - combined with this other addition are incongruous to the original historic design of the home - and create the dreaded “McMansion effect” to the home – drastically altering the style of the structure from the rear façade and are clearly not in keeping with the scale and integrity of the c. 1920’s Colonial Revival Cottage style. The design also creates a space for the Owners of the property to linger outside on the balcony **within** the setback, this is the reason accessory use like patios,

decks and balconies are prohibited in the first place within this area - to provide the proper distance and privacy to neighbors.

The proposed project is counter to the of the 2000 City of Summit Master Plan Objectives in that it does not “recognize and preserve the historic character of the City” and does not “encourage the preservation of historic buildings and landmarks that are significant to Summit’s past.”

As a result, the Historic Preservation Commission recommends the Board of Adjustment require this “turret” porch/balcony be removed from the design in order to grant the variance.

The Commission unanimously ratified the letter previously sent by Tom Conway to Gina Binetti, Land Use Assistant for the City of Summit.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

1. Report on actions taken by Zoning and Planning Board on applications for which HPC provided Advisory Review

NEW BUSINESS

1. Request by Planning Board for comments on the Reexamination of the Historic Preservation Plan Element of the Master Plan. HPC members plan to take the lead on various parts of the plan.

2. Announcement of "The Taste of Summit" to be held @ The Grand Summit Hotel on April 3, 2016 from 6-8:30PM

Meeting adjourned at 8:54