

**MEETING Minutes**  
**CITY OF SUMMIT HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

February 16, 2022 7:00pm  
Via Zoom: Thomas Conway Host

**CALL TO ORDER: ADEQUATE ADVANCED NOTICE STATEMENT**

**ROLL CALL:** BRANDON RIGHI, JAMES BURGMAYER, TOM CONWAY, MEREDITH GAYLORD, CAROLINE KING, ALISON CHIEFFO, ASHLEY ALBAHARY, GREG VARTAN (COUNCIL LIAISON), JENNIFER BALSON-ALVAREZ (PLANNING BOARD LIAISON),

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** MINUTES FROM 1/19/2022 – by Alison Chieffo

**ADVISORY REVIEWS**

Collective Reviews

1. 30 Glen Oaks Avenue – D variance for FAR & C variance to construct 2-story addition and patio. The scale and proportions of the proposed renovation addition are in keeping with the neighborhood as well as the materials. The preference would be to maintain the wood shingle roof but we are aware of the financial commitment. The HPC recommends that the Board approves this application.
2. 24 Prospect Street - D variance for FAR & C variances to construct rear 2<sup>nd</sup> story addition. The proposed rear addition is in keeping with the style and character of the house and will not be visible from the street. The proposed dormers on the front are in keeping with the house's colonial architecture and the general feel of the surrounding neighborhood. HPC has no objections.
3. 9 Laurel Avenue – D variance for FAR & C variance for building height to construct rear addition. This property sits in the Summit Home Land Company Historic District. The proposed renovation/addition is in keeping with the character and style of the house, and the neighborhood of modest Colonial Revival homes. Additionally, a majority of the increase in square footage is in the rear of the property. The HPC recommends the board approve this application.
4. 5 Morris Court – C variances for building coverage & lot coverage to construct 2-story addition. The proposed renovation and addition are keeping with style of existing house and neighborhood. The HPC proposes that this application be approved.
5. 25 Ascot Way – C variances for side-yard setback and lot coverage to construct 2<sup>nd</sup> story addition. In keeping with Summit style guidelines and the DRO, the HPC recommends that the owners simplify the external materials being used in the renovation so that the structure is in keeping with the neighborhood. This could be accomplished by using a single type of exterior siding (preferably cement board) and having the foundation be stucco or brick instead of artificial stone. The HPC commends the scale of the renovation, and the tasteful roofline employed on this expansion of a mid-century split-level.

6. 14 Winchester Road – D variance for FAR & C variances to construct 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> story additions. The HPC is concerned about this application. The proposed massing scale and style do not keep in line with the neighborhood. We recommend the application draw from the neighborhood homes for style and scale.
7. 22 Badeau Avenue – D variance for FAR & C variance to construct rear addition & 2<sup>nd</sup> story addition. This 1925 Dutch colonial revival home is located on a street with a rich architectural heritage and is within the Northside Historic District. The side and rear additions mimic the architectural style of the house and the massing and scale are in keeping with the houses in the neighborhood. The exterior facade materials are not noted on the elevations. The commission requests that materials on the additions match the natural wood siding on the original house. The HPC takes no exception to this application.

## **NEW BUSINESS**

1. Liaison Updates & News:

Greg Vartan – City Council – Update on budget process, city working on a set of standards and guideline for parklets, Maple Street closure from Mar 15 - Nov 15. SDI bringing on consultant to explore possible programing for permanent closure. Broad St Redevelopment LOI unanimously approved.

Jennifer Alvarez – Planning Board – The City has signed agreement with consultant Barton Ross to review draft of historic ordinance. Consultant will present to Planning Board and give overview on historic ordinances and discuss historic ordinances in other towns in NJ.

2. Broad Street West Development (BSWD) Workshop – Five members of the HPC attended the BSWD workshop on February 9<sup>th</sup>. The commissioners that attended were alarmed and offended that the developers referenced the HPC making it appear that the HPC was in favor of this project as proposed thus distributed misleading information to the general public. Previously on August 2, 2021 the HPC summited comments on the BSWD project to the City of Summit. None of the HPC's recommendations or concerns were reflected in this workshop presentations meeting.

The commissioners feel this project area is of great concern to the HPC because it sits adjacent to the Summit Downtown Historic District overlooking our Historic Green - listed on the National Register and State of NJ Jersey Register. Broad Street West redevelopment has the unusual weighty responsibility - to compliment and blend the hugely diverse scale of historic, civic, use, and building types that both encircle it - and are encapsulated in it – the Green, Post Office building, YMCA, our senior housing, Summit City Hall, St. Teresa of Avila Campus / Memorial Hall, the end of Historic Prospect Street, The Connection, Library, Middle School, and Central Presbyterian. We are seeking sensitive contextual design appropriate to the suburban size and character of our special town – this area could at best become the “golden triangle” adding the needed beauty and complimented vitality for a modernized town, or at worst could be visually overwhelming and suck the life away from our already historic downtown while creating safety and parking concerns.

Our Commission, like our city, takes this seriously and wants to help ensure that we think about this all contextually. Contextualism in design and city planning is by nature a linear process, and the HPC remains concerned that City of Summit is taking the unusual step in a “developer first” approach (instead of first using a city planning company to shape the building envelope first with required scale and use) and if the end result will be what we need. Nonetheless, we understand the huge pressure in timing and financial magnitude of moving the Fire House and the concurrent need to immediately develop Subdistrict #3 to help lessen the financial blow to the taxpayers.

### **Subdistrict #3**

HPC feels the subdistrict #3 proposal is successful in the “background infill design” approach and the overall architectural expression is in keeping with the surrounding building fabric – while importantly being of their own time and reflective of modern use and style. However, the proposal has major issues capturing our unique Summit “City” SCALE. This is in relation to its number of residents, building width, plus the interconnection between the perimeter uses and this new development bring a number of safety, traffic, and parking concerns. The proposed building bulk, visual bulk, location of parking, and the overly- zealous effort to “place make and activate” within this area we feel will undermine the vitality of our existing downtown.

- Building proposed is too large and uniform – it would be the largest building in town way over 500 feet on Broad Street. This should only be a 4-story building to fit in best with the surrounding streetscape.
- The parking entrance and exit should be on Broad Street with an additional traffic light. This would eliminate the Morris Ave and the Cedar Street connections. This is also an opportunity to break up the monolithic quality of this building.
- There is clearly not enough parking on sight for the building that is proposed. Additionally parking for the retail businesses should be across broad street.
- The proposed green space needs to just be clean open lawn area with trees and plantings. There should not be any additional structures or uses in this space.

### **NEXT MEETING**

DATE: Wednesday March 16, 2022 via Zoom

### **MOTION TO ADJOURN**